## RDD

James J. Heckman University of Chicago

## Econ 350, Spring 2023 This draft, March 30, 2023 12:37 Noon



Heckman

## **Regression Discontinuity Estimators and LATE**



Heckman

- Campbell (1969) developed the regression discontinuity design estimator.
- Hahn, Todd, and Van der Klaauw (2001) present an exposition of the regression discontinuity estimator within a LATE framework.



- Standard IV assumptions hold, except that we relax independence assumption (A-1) to assume that (Y<sub>1</sub> - Y<sub>0</sub>, U<sub>D</sub>) is independent of Z conditional on X.
- We do not impose the condition that Y<sub>0</sub> is independent of Z conditional on X.



• Using 
$$Y = Y_0 + D(Y_1 - Y_0)$$
, we obtain:

$$E(Y|X = x, Z = z) = E(Y_0|X = x, Z = z) +E(D(Y_1 - Y_0)|X = x, Z = z) = E(Y_0|X = x, Z = z) + \int_0^{P(z)} E(Y_1 - Y_0|X = x, U_D = u) du.$$

So

$$\frac{\frac{\partial}{\partial z}E(Y|X=x,Z=z)}{\frac{\partial}{\partial z}P(z)} = \frac{\frac{\partial}{\partial z}E(Y_0|X=x,Z=z)}{\frac{\partial}{\partial z}P(z)} + E(Y_1 - Y_0|X=x,U_D = P(z))$$

CHICAGO

Heckman

• Likewise, for discrete changes of IV:

$$= \underbrace{\frac{E(Y|X = x, Z = z) - E(Y|X = x, Z = z')}{P(z) - P(z')}}_{\text{E}(Y_0|X = x, Z = z) - E(Y_0|X = x, Z = z')}_{P(z) - P(z')}$$

$$+\underbrace{E(Y_1 - Y_0|X = x, P(z) > U_D > P(z'))}_{\text{LATE}}$$

Recover LATE *plus* a bias term.



- A regression discontinuity design allows analysts to recover a LATE parameter at **a particular value of Z**.
- If E(Y<sub>0</sub>|X = x, Z = z) is continuous in z, while P(z) is discontinuous in z at a particular point, then it will be possible to use a regression discontinuity design to recover a LATE parameter.



 While the regression discontinuity design does have the advantage of allowing Y<sub>0</sub> to depend on Z conditional on X, it only recovers a LATE parameter at a particular value of Z and cannot in general be used to recover either other treatment parameters such as the average treatment effect or the answers to policy questions such as the PRTE.



- The following discussion is motivated by the analysis of Hahn et al. (2001).
- For simplicity, assume that Z is scalar.
- First, consider LIV while relaxing independence assumption

   (A-1) to assume that (Y<sub>1</sub> Y<sub>0</sub>, U<sub>D</sub>) is independent of Z
   conditional on X but without imposing that Y<sub>0</sub> is independent
   of Z conditional on X.
- In order to make the comparison with the regression discontinuity design easier, we will condition on Z instead of P(Z).



• Using 
$$Y = Y_0 + D(Y_1 - Y_0)$$
, we obtain:

$$E(Y|X = x, Z = z) = E(Y_0|X = x, Z = z) +E(D(Y_1 - Y_0)|X = x, Z = z) = E(Y_0|X = x, Z = z) + \int_0^{P(z)} E(Y_1 - Y_0|X = x, U_D = u) du.$$

So

$$\frac{\frac{\partial}{\partial z}E(Y|X=x,Z=z)}{\frac{\partial}{\partial z}P(z)} = \frac{\frac{\partial}{\partial z}E(Y_0|X=x,Z=z)}{\frac{\partial}{\partial z}P(z)} + E(Y_1 - Y_0|X=x,U_D=P(z))$$

CHICAGO

Heckman

- We have assumed that  $\frac{\partial}{\partial z}P(z) \neq 0$ .
- We have also assumed that  $E(Y_0|X = x, Z = z)$  is differentiable in z.
- Notice that under our stronger independence condition (A-1),  $\frac{\partial}{\partial z}E(Y_0|X = x, Z = z) = 0$  so that we identify MTE as before.
- With  $Y_0$  possibly dependent on Z conditional on X, we now get MTE plus the bias term that depends on  $\frac{\partial}{\partial z}E(Y_0|X=x, Z=z).$



• Likewise, if we consider the discrete change form of IV:

$$= \underbrace{\frac{E(Y|X = x, Z = z) - E(Y|X = x, Z = z')}{P(z) - P(z')}}_{\text{E}(Y_0|X = x, Z = z) - E(Y_0|X = x, Z = z')}_{P(z) - P(z')}$$

$$+\underbrace{E(Y_1 - Y_0|X = x, P(z) > U_D > P(z'))}_{\text{LATE}}$$

so that we now recover LATE plus a bias term.



- Consider a regression discontinuity design.
- Suppose that there exists an evaluation point  $z_0$  Z such that  $P(\cdot)$  is discontinuous at  $z_0$ ,
- Suppose that  $E(Y_0|X = x, Z = z)$  is continuous at  $z_0$ .
- Suppose that  $P(\cdot)$  is increasing in a neighborhood of  $z_0$ .

Let

$$P(z_0-) = \lim_{\epsilon \downarrow 0} P(z_0-\epsilon),$$
$$P(z_0+) = \lim_{\epsilon \downarrow 0} P(z_0+\epsilon).$$

 Note that the conditions that P(·) is increasing in a neighborhood of z₀ and discontinuous at z₀ imply that P(z₀+) > P(z₀-). Let

$$\mu(x, z_0-) = \lim_{\epsilon \downarrow 0} E(Y|X = x, Z = z_0 - \epsilon),$$
  
$$\mu(x, z_0+) = \lim_{\epsilon \downarrow 0} E(Y|X = x, Z = z_0 + \epsilon).$$

Note that

$$\mu(x, z_0-) = E(Y_0|X = x, Z = z_0) + \int_0^{P(z_0-)} E(Y_1 - Y_0|U_D = u_D) du_D$$

and

$$\mu(x, z_0+) = E(Y_0|X = x, Z = z_0) \\ + \int_0^{P(z_0+)} E(Y_1 - Y_0|X = x, U_D = u_D) du_D.$$

• We used the fact that  $E(Y_0|X = x, Z = z)$  is continuous at  $z_0$ .

Heckman

$$\mu(x, z_0+) - \mu(x, z_0-) = \int_{P(z_0-)}^{P(z_0+)} E(Y_1 - Y_0|X = x, U_D = u_D) du_D$$

$$\Rightarrow \frac{\mu(x, z_0+) - \mu(x, z_0-)}{P(z_0+) - P(z_0-)} = E(Y_1 - Y_0|X = x, P(z_0+) \ge U_D > P(z_0-))$$

• We have recovered a LATE parameter for a particular point of evaluation.



- Note that if P(z) is only discontinuous at  $z_0$ , then we only identify  $E(Y_1 Y_0 | X = x, P(z_0+) \ge U_D > (z_0-))$  and not any LATE or MTE at any other evaluation points.
- While this discussion assumes that Z is a scalar, it is straightforward to generalize the discussion to allow for Z to be a vector.
- For more discussion of the regression discontinuity design estimator and an example, see Hahn et al. (2001), *Econometrica*.

